

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
BUREAU OF INTERNET & TECHNOLOGY

In the Matter of

Assurance No. 21-058

**Investigation by LETITIA JAMES,
Attorney General of the State of New York, of**

**DENVER MEDIA HOLDINGS LLC
d/b/a BOLDTICKET.COM,**

Respondent.

ASSURANCE OF DISCONTINUANCE

The Office of the Attorney General of the State of New York (“NYAG”) commenced an investigation pursuant to Executive Law § 63(12) and General Business Law § 349 into the resale of event tickets by respondent Denver Media Holdings LLC (“DMH”), owner and operator of ticket resale website boldticket.com. This Assurance of Discontinuance (“Assurance”) contains the findings of NYAG’s investigation and the relief agreed to by NYAG and Respondent, whether acting through its respective directors, officers, employees, representatives, agents, affiliates, or subsidiaries (collectively, the “Parties”).

FINDINGS OF NYAG

1. Respondent DMH is a Colorado-based company, which at all relevant periods was engaged in the business of facilitating the resale of tickets to live events through its website boldticket.com (the “Resale Website”).

2. Respondent provided marketing services intended to direct internet traffic to the Resale Website, where prospective buyers can search on the secondary market for tickets to events, for example by event type, artist or team name, venue, or date. A search for tickets on

the Resale Website displayed tickets that independent third parties have listed for resale on a platform owned and operated by DMH's third-party vendor, Ticket Fulfillment Services, L.P. ("TFS"), a wholly-owned subsidiary of Vivid Seats LLC.

3. DMH displayed the TFS platform on the Resale Website pursuant to a contract with TFS. When a consumer used the Resale Website to purchase a ticket through the TFS platform, TFS managed, verified, and processed the order, and ensured the fulfillment of the order, including delivery of tickets. DMH did not itself offer any tickets for resale through the Resale Website, and did not process or fulfill the orders that customers placed through the Resale Website.

4. TFS also handled customer service on behalf of DMH. For example, if a customer called the customer service telephone number displayed on the Resale Website, that call was routed to TFS. At times, however, TFS would consult with DMH about how to respond to a particular inquiry.

5. On a weekly basis, TFS disbursed to DMH the contractual commission it earned for any sales made on the platform through the Resale Website. DMH had the ability to adjust the prices of or add service fees to tickets available on the platform through the Resale Website, which in turn affected the amount of its commission.

6. The parties' contract required DMH to reimburse TFS for any commissions TFS had previously distributed to it, if the event for which the ticket was previously sold were canceled for any reason. TFS had the right to deduct any such amounts from future payments to DMH.

7. The parties' contract also appended Terms and Conditions drafted by TFS that DMH was required under the agreement to post on its Resale Website. From at least January 15,

2018 through May 2020, the Terms of Service available on the Resale Website promised consumers that they would receive a refund if the event for which they were purchasing a ticket was canceled.

8. Over the course of February and March 2020, the threat of the novel coronavirus COVID-19 began to materialize in significant ways. With COVID-19 cases mounting in New York State, on March 12, 2020, New York Governor Andrew Cuomo issued Executive Order 202.1, temporarily prohibiting public gatherings of more than five hundred people. Public ticketed events were canceled en masse both within New York and around the country.

9. During the month of April 2020, DMH and TFS conferred about the extensive dislocation in the secondary market for ticket events, and its impact on DMH's and TFS's finances. TFS created and provided spreadsheets to DMH that quantified DMH's financial obligations arising from mass event cancellations. These documents compared the financial effect of continuing to offer cash refunds for all purchasers with store credit.

10. As cancellations continued to pile up, DMH and TFS coordinated to limit DMH's exposure to a wave of refunds. On April 26, 2020, DMH represented to TFS by email that the company did not "have another option at this point other than to offer site credit[,] as the cost of the potential refunds if more events are canceled is more than we can afford to return in commission." Two days later, on April 28, 2020, DMH's owner wrote to representatives with TFS expressing concern about the legality of a blanket store credit policy.

11. Notwithstanding that concern, on or about May 15, 2020, DMH and TFS posted a revised version of the Terms and Conditions to the Resale Website. The new policy stated that if the ticketed event is canceled, DMH "will give you a full refund of the purchase price or will issue a credit for use on a future purchase, as determined in its sole discretion (unless otherwise

required by applicable law).” Yet despite that promise to provide refunds where “required by applicable law,” DMH and TFS continued to deny refunds even where the law required them to guarantee refunds, including to purchasers who had bought tickets to events within New York State that were canceled after DMH and TFS implemented these revisions.

12. At or around the same time that they posted the revised Terms of Service, and by no later than May 17, 2020, DMH and TFS sent out emails to customers who had already received a prior notice informing them that their event had been canceled. These emails told consumers, all of whom had purchased their tickets pursuant to a promise that they would be refunded if the event were canceled, that they were instead subject to the store credit policy. DMH and TFS continued to send out substantially similar emails to consumers when new cancellations occurred.

13. Throughout this period, TFS would notify DMH of individual complaints they received through the customer service portals. Although the parties agreed in certain individual cases to provide refunds, they (through TFS’s direct communications with consumers) continued to deny refunds to other purchasers entitled to refunds by law and to provide store credit as the default option—and failed to notify consumers that they might be entitled to refunds by law.

14. These practices harmed consumers by failing to provide refunds they were entitled to by law, deceiving consumers by misrepresenting their eligibility for a refund, and failing to honor express refund promises.

Regulatory Framework

15. Executive Law § 63(12) and General Business Law §§ 349 and 350 prohibit misrepresentation and deceptive acts or practices in the conduct of any business.

16. Executive Law § 63(12) also prohibits illegal practices in the conduct of any

business. Arts and Cultural Affairs Law § 25.07 requires any person, firm, or corporation that facilitates the resale of event tickets to guarantee that it will refund to the purchaser the amount paid by the purchaser (including, but not limited to, all fees, regardless of how characterized) if the event for which such ticket has been resold is canceled, notwithstanding any other provision of law.

Respondent's Conduct Violated New York Law

17. NYAG finds that Respondent's conduct violated, *inter alia*, Executive Law § 63(12), which authorizes NYAG to pursue repeated fraudulent or illegal acts; GBL §§ 349 and 350, which prohibit deceptive acts and practices and false advertising; and Arts and Cultural Affairs Law § 25.07, which requires any person, firm, or corporation that facilitates the resale of event tickets to guarantee refunds to purchasers if the event for which the purchaser has bought a ticket is canceled.

18. Respondent neither admits nor denies NYAG's Findings, paragraphs 1–14 above.

19. NYAG finds the relief and agreements contained in this Assurance appropriate and in the public interest. THEREFORE, NYAG is willing to accept this Assurance pursuant to Executive Law § 63(15), in lieu of commencing a statutory proceeding for violations of Executive Law § 63(12), GBL §§ 349 and 350, and Arts and Cultural Affairs Law § 25.07.

IT IS HEREBY UNDERSTOOD AND AGREED, by and between the Parties:

RELIEF

20. Respondent shall not directly or indirectly – on its own or through any existing or future firm or other business structure – engage, or attempt to engage, in conduct in violation of Executive Law § 63(12), GBL §§ 349 and 350, and Arts and Cultural Affairs Law § 25.07, and expressly agrees and acknowledges that any such conduct is a violation of the Assurance, and

that NYAG thereafter may commence the civil action or proceeding contemplated in paragraph 19, *supra*, in addition to any other appropriate investigation, action, or proceeding.

21. Within thirty (30) days of the Effective Date of this Assurance, Respondent shall notify or cause to be notified (i) all New York State residents who placed an order on the Resale Website at any time prior to May 15, 2020 for an event to be held in any venue outside of New York State at any time after January 1, 2020, which event was thereafter canceled (the “NY Resident Purchasers”); and (ii) all consumers regardless of residency who placed an order on the Resale Website for an event to be held in any venue within New York State at any time after January 1, 2020, which event was thereafter canceled (the “NY Venue Purchasers,” and collectively with the NY Resident Purchasers, “Covered Purchasers”), that they are eligible for a refund of their entire purchase price, and may choose either (i) to claim that refund, less any credit the consumer may have already received in lieu of that refund and used on a purchase, or (ii) to retain any credit the consumer may have already received in lieu of that refund.

a. To the extent Respondent has refunded a Covered Purchaser in full for a Covered Order or has provided or delivered notice on or after February 8, 2021 to a Covered Purchaser of that Purchaser’s eligibility for a refund for a Covered Order and have not through the Effective Date of this Assurance received a request for a refund, Respondent need not provide notice pursuant to this paragraph to the Covered Purchaser with respect to the Covered Order for which that Purchaser has been so refunded or notified.

b. Any notice sent pursuant to this paragraph shall be sent by email to the email address associated with the order and (i) inform consumers, in both the subject line and body of the email, that the notice concerns a refund offer for the consumer's ticket order; (ii) identify with specificity the event and/or order to which the refund offer relates; and (iii) clearly and conspicuously inform the consumer how to claim a refund.

22. Within fourteen (14) days of the Effective Date of this Assurance, Respondent shall conduct a full review of the statements on their Resale Website concerning refunds for canceled events and shall ensure that any and all such statements disclose that consumers may be entitled to refunds under applicable law.

23. In any communication occurring after the Effective Date of this Assurance that is made by Respondent to a consumer concerning a canceled event, Respondent shall clearly and conspicuously inform the consumer that he or she may be entitled to a refund under applicable law.

MISCELLANEOUS

24. Acceptance of this Assurance by NYAG is not an approval or endorsement by NYAG of any of Respondent's policies, practices, or procedures, and Respondent shall make no representation to the contrary.

25. Respondent expressly agrees and acknowledges that NYAG may initiate a subsequent investigation, civil action, or proceeding to enforce this Assurance, for violations of the Assurance, or if the Assurance is voided pursuant to paragraph 32, and agrees and acknowledges that in such event:

a. any statute of limitations or other time-related defenses are tolled from and after the effective date of this Assurance;

b. the NYAG may use statements, documents or other materials produced or provided by Respondent prior to or after the effective date of this Assurance;

c. any civil action or proceeding must be adjudicated by the courts of the State of New York, and that Respondent irrevocably and unconditionally waives any objection based upon personal jurisdiction, inconvenient forum, or venue.

d. evidence of a violation of this Assurance shall constitute prima facie proof of a violation of the applicable law pursuant to Executive Law § 63(15).

26. If a court of competent jurisdiction determines that Respondent has violated the Assurance, Respondent shall pay to the NYAG the reasonable cost, if any, of obtaining such determination and of enforcing this Assurance, including without limitation legal fees, expenses, and court costs.

27. This Assurance is not intended for use by any third party in any other proceeding.

28. All terms and conditions of this Assurance shall continue in full force and effect on any successor, assignee, or transferee of Respondent. Respondent shall include any such successor, assignment or transfer agreement a provision that binds the successor, assignee or transferee to the terms of the Assurance. No party may assign, delegate, or otherwise transfer any of its rights or obligations under this Assurance without the prior written consent of NYAG.

29. Nothing contained herein shall be construed as to deprive any person of any private right under the law, nor to waive any legal argument or defense not expressly waived herein.

30. Any failure by the NYAG to insist upon the strict performance by Respondent of any of the provisions of this Assurance shall not be deemed a waiver of any of the provisions hereof, and the NYAG, notwithstanding that failure, shall have the right thereafter to insist upon

the strict performance of any and all of the provisions of this Assurance to be performed by Respondent.

31. All notices, reports, requests, and other communications pursuant to this Assurance must reference Assurance No. 21-058, and shall be in writing and shall, unless expressly provided otherwise herein, be given by hand delivery; express courier; or electronic mail at an address designated in writing by the recipient, followed by postage prepaid mail, and shall be addressed as follows:

If to Respondent, to:

Denver Media Holdings, LLC
7318 S Revere Parkway, Unit A3
Centennial, CO 80112

If to NYAG, to:

Bureau Chief
Bureau of Internet & Technology
New York State Office of the Attorney General
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005

32. NYAG has agreed to the terms of this Assurance based on, among other things, the representations made to NYAG by Respondent and its counsel and NYAG's own factual investigation as set forth in Findings, paragraphs 1–14 above. Respondent represents and warrants that neither it nor its counsel has made any material representations to NYAG that are inaccurate or misleading. If any material representations by Respondent or its counsel are later found to be inaccurate or misleading, this Assurance is voidable by NYAG in its sole discretion.

33. No representation, inducement, promise, understanding, condition, or warranty not set forth in this Assurance has been made to or relied upon by Respondent in agreeing to this Assurance.

34. Respondent represents and warrants, through the signatures below, that the terms and conditions of this Assurance are duly approved.

35. Unless a term limit for compliance is otherwise specified within this Assurance, the Respondent's obligations under this Assurance are enduring. Nothing in this Agreement shall relieve Respondent of other obligations imposed by any applicable state or federal law or regulation or other applicable law.

36. Respondent agrees not to take any action or to make or permit to be made any public statement denying, directly or indirectly, any finding in the Assurance or creating the impression that the Assurance is without legal or factual basis. Nothing in this paragraph affects Respondent's right to take legal or factual positions in defense of litigation or other legal proceedings to which the NYAG is not a party.

37. Nothing contained herein shall be construed to limit the remedies available to NYAG in the event that Respondent violates the Assurance after its effective date.

38. This Assurance may not be amended except by an instrument in writing signed on behalf of the Parties to this Assurance.

39. In the event that any one or more of the provisions contained in this Assurance shall for any reason be held by a court of competent jurisdiction to be invalid, illegal, or unenforceable in any respect, in the sole discretion of NYAG, such invalidity, illegality, or unenforceability shall not affect any other provision of this Assurance.

40. Respondent acknowledges that it has entered this Assurance freely and voluntarily and upon due deliberation with the advice of counsel.

41. This Assurance shall be governed by the laws of the State of New York without regard to any conflict of laws principles.

42. The Assurance and all its terms shall be construed as if mutually drafted with no presumption of any type against any party that may be found to have been the drafter.

43. This Assurance may be executed in multiple counterparts by the Parties hereto. All counterparts so executed shall constitute one agreement binding upon all Parties, notwithstanding that all Parties are not signatories to the original or the same counterpart. Each counterpart shall be deemed an original to this Assurance, all of which shall constitute one agreement to be valid as of the effective date of this Assurance. For purposes of this Assurance, copies of signatures shall be treated the same as originals. Documents executed, scanned and transmitted electronically and electronic signatures shall be deemed original signatures for purposes of this Assurance and all matters related thereto, with such scanned and electronic signatures having the same legal effect as original signatures.

44. The effective date of this Assurance shall be August 30, 2021.

LETITIA JAMES
Attorney General of the State of New York
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005

By:



Ezra Sternstein
Assistant Attorney General
Bureau of Internet & Technology

Denver Media Holdings LLC

Jason Gamwell

By: Jason Gamwell

Title: Chief Executive Officer

08 / 29 / 2021

Date